COPYRIGHT EXCEPTIONS AND LIMITATIONS
JOINT POSITION

WIPO STANDING COMMITTEE ON COPYRIGHT AND RELATED RIGHTS, 17TH SESSION

Every nation can transform the creativity and knowledge of its people into a motor for social, cultural and economic development. The national legislative framework is a critical determinant of whether creative industries can develop. Within this framework, copyright plays a vital role as it is the most important asset for creative industries. Its value and potential for delivering development are determined by the way legal rights function in practice.

The signatory Non-Governmental Organisations - each an international representative for creators, performers or creative industries in its field – base their consideration on the following general principles:

1. Existing flexibilities are not only adequate but preferable. There is no need for new international binding norms restricting the freedom to develop locally adapted exceptions and limitations.

2. At national level, all legislative options should be built on a flexible and fair foundation that is based on the notion of lawful access for users respecting the rights of creators and other rightsholders.

3. The signatories can provide many examples of good national models and practices, drafted within the present international norms.
Existing International Binding Norms on Exceptions and Limitations

Exceptions and limitations in copyright legislation are a fundamental part of the copyright system, defining the scope of rights. Striking a balance between the rights of copyright holders and interests of users of works has been at the heart of WIPO's work over decades. The present international IPR framework, consisting of exclusive rights combined with a set of exceptions and limitations governed by the three-step-test, is based on a delicate equilibrium which has benefited creators and users alike, and should continue to be. Optimal flexibility requires general international principles which leave specific implementation for Member States.

The three-step test, as set out in the major international intellectual property treaties, is a common international standard and a long-established high-level principle. According to Article 9.2 of the Berne Convention, Article 10 WCT, Article 16 WPPT and Article 13 of the TRIPS Agreement, the three-step test provides a safety net for all exceptions and limitations, allowing flexibilities as long as the common criteria are respected.

More detailed internationally binding norms on a set of minimum exceptions and limitations would not serve their supposed purpose: ensuring improved access in an ever-changing media landscape. Turning flexibilities into mandatory international norms would be de facto counterproductive. Instead of new binding norm-setting activities at the international level the focus should be at national level. Application of the three-step test by national legislatures and courts has shown time and again that its inherent flexibility allows for appropriate national solutions. This flexibility is vital to equilibrium at national level.

Equilibrium at National Level

How current international norms serve the interest of a country is a vital question at national level. To achieve a stable equilibrium, a holistic and long-term approach is needed. A sustainable approach must ensure lawful access to knowledge-based material and promote local film, music, writing and publishing activities and cultural diversity.

We all aspire to give everyone the greatest possible access to the best possible content, both local and international. This is one of the overall goals of the copyright system. However, to provide free access through mandatory exceptions would sacrifice long-term sustainability for perceived short-term gain. Local industries that directly support the growth of the information society rely on the copyright system.

Educational publishing is the motor of the publishing sector. For instance in South Africa it represents 74 % of the publishing market. In most countries, the publishing sector comprises mostly small-and-medium sized enterprises. A solid legal, economic and cultural environment is needed to boost their development. With appropriate enhancement a real change can be achieved, as the success story from Cameroon shows: from 2000 to 2006 the share of local textbooks rose from 11 % to 50 %, with the support of the World Bank.

In the newspaper sector, the World Association of Newspapers is particularly active in Africa in Newspaper in Education development projects which include training of teachers, workshops, involvement of local publishers and distribution of newspapers in schools. Research shows that media literacy and Newspaper in Education (NIE) programs influence positively student motivation, academic skills and classroom communications. The newspaper keeps students informed and helps mould them into responsible and socially aware citizens.

Films and television programmes are important to wealth creation and cultural diversity throughout the world. The current

1 South African Book Development Council, Factors influencing the cost of books in South Africa, Department: Arts and Culture, Republic of South Africa, June 2007
2 Intervention of Freddy Ngandu, representative of IPA, Cameroon, at the First Inter-sessional Intergovernmental Meeting on a Development Agenda for WIPO, April 2005
growth of audiovisual industries in Eastern and Western African countries, such as Kenya’s “Riverwood” and Nigeria’s “Nollywood”, could be greatly enhanced through the effective application of copyright law to stimulate creativity and investment in the production infrastructure.

The share of local music repertoire is significant in many countries. In Mexico, for example, local repertoire is approximately 70 % of the market. In Argentina, the local repertoire also accounts for the largest segment of the market; about 45 % in 2007, compared to 16 % Spanish and 35 % of English and other repertoires. These repertoires need a properly functioning IP system in order to maintain and increase their potential.

**Toolbox of Solutions**

Authors, producers, publishers and distributors have every interest to ensure lawful access on reasonable terms. Writers write, musicians perform, producers and publishers develop, finance and distribute content, each with the goal of seeking the widest possible audience, provided that their intellectual property rights are respected and allow them to seek to recover production costs and generate a return on their creative and financial investments. Accessibility is an important issue and there exist a variety of ways to offer access, ranging from selling books, CDs and DVDs to licensing a wide range of electronic delivery and digital platforms.

The needs of important user groups, such as educational establishments, libraries and archives and those of disabled persons, must be taken into account. However, exceptions and limitations are just one tool amongst many. They often provide an inflexible solution to a broad range of different circumstances. Sometimes, sector-specific solutions need to be fashioned. The law should facilitate tailor-made solutions, and in many countries it does.

Collaboration between stakeholders can bring clear advantages in ensuring accessibility in constantly evolving usage scenarios. That is one of the conclusions in the recent study, commissioned by WIPO, on copyright limitations and exceptions for the visually impaired⁴. Trust and understanding between stakeholders can bring partners to flexible solutions that change over time. The needs of disabled persons can be met by properly analysing and addressing the obstacles they meet with the aim of ensuring their equal treatment. Many stakeholders in the audiovisual sector provide tools to make their products more accessible to people with disabilities: additional features on DVDs including video description for visually impaired viewers and subtitles for hearing impaired.

In the publishing sector, research and educational communities constitute the most significant audiences and markets for some authors and publishers. The very essence of normal exploitation is to offer publications and information services to these non-commercial communities. The interest of research and education is best served by encouraging the creation of new works, publications and information services that serve the communication within these communities.

Innovative partnerships⁵ between publishers, libraries, governments and UN organisations not only provide access, but also training on how to make use of resources voluntarily made available. We are happy to expand more on these examples and other win-win solutions in different creative industries during the course of forthcoming deliberations.

Copyright provides a legal basis for licensing both analogue and digital material. In cases where exceptions and limitations are an appropriate tool, the present framework of commonly accepted international norms (in particular the three-

---

⁴ Study on Copyright Limitations and Exceptions for the Visually Impaired, prepared by Judith Sullivan, February 20, 2007

⁵ HINARI (Health InterNetwork Access to Research Initiative) [http://www.who.int/hinari](http://www.who.int/hinari), AGORA (Access to Global Online Research Agriculture) [http://www.aginternetwork.org](http://www.aginternetwork.org), OARE (Online Access to Research in the Environment) [http://www.oaresciences.org](http://www.oaresciences.org)
step-test) allows for flexible and tailored solutions.

**Licensing can interact with Exceptions and Limitations**

Licensing agreements can offer wide usage opportunities, based on tailor-made solutions. Agreements can be concluded individually between users and rightsholders, or collectively with collective management organisations, when appropriate. In collective licensing, Reproduction Rights Organisations (RROs) as specialised organisations have a wealth of experience on how to serve educational and library users in different parts of the world. In this area, access by citizens is improved all the time, through a variety of pragmatic solutions which include voluntary agreements.

Licensing agreements should be available to cover all large-scale and systematic copying for education and research. Online accessibility in libraries and other cultural institutions can be achieved through licensing avoiding the risk that exceptions and limitations could conflict with the normal exploitation of the works. Exceptions and limitations can interact in useful ways with licensing agreements and there are many ways to incorporate unremunerated copying into licenses, for example by deducting copies made under an exception or adjusting the remuneration to take into account unremunerated copying.

**Well-Crafted National Exceptions and Limitations**

In cases where exceptions and limitations are appropriate, they need to be individually crafted and carefully defined at national level. This applies irrespective of the form: specified norms or more general fair use/fair dealing provisions. One important goal is predictability, and any national legislative initiative should be based on a long-term impact analysis. The consequences of an unbalanced solution could endanger the development of national creativity and creative industries, and threaten cultural diversity. That would be to the detriment of creators, performers, publishers, producers, users and ultimately society as a whole.

**Good Examples and Practices**

The signatories can provide examples of individual and collective licensing where broad access has been achieved on the basis of voluntary agreements and collaborative approaches, providing greater flexibility, predictability and ease of use than solely reliance on statutory exceptions and limitations.

We are happy to give information on appropriate national models and practices in both analogue and digital environments. We look forward to participating constructively in the forthcoming dialogue in the Standing Committee on Copyright and Related Rights.

---

November 2008